

Date : 10/12/2018 8:19:13 AM
From : "MCCOSKER Juliana"
To : "WELLS Melissa"
Subject : FW: Expert Review- Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP)
Attachment : Terms of Reference for BTFMP Expert Review.pdf;DDG Letter to Prof B Wintle - 07-12-18.pdf;image001.png;image002.png;image005.png;
FYI

From: WELLS Melissa
Sent: Friday, 7 December 2018 2:29 PM
To: MCCOSKER Juliana; BENNINK Kate
Subject: FW: Expert Review - Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP)



Melissa Wells
Executive Director
Coal and Central Qld Compliance
Department of Environment and Science

P 07 4987 9343

99 Hospital Road, Emerald QLD 4720
PO Box 3028, Emerald QLD 4720

From: Corro DES ESR DDG
Sent: Friday, 7 December 2018 2:24 PM
To: b.wintle@unimelb.edu.au
Cc: WELLS Melissa <Melissa.Wells@des.qld.gov.au>
Subject: Expert Review - Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP)

Dear Professor Wintle

Please find attached letter from Dean Ellwood DDG ESR in relation to undertaking an Expert review of the BTFMP. Please note the original will not be posted.

Kind regards
Tonina



**Office of the Deputy Director-General
Environmental Services and Regulation**
Department of Environment and Science

P 07 3330 5549

Level 7, 400 George St, Brisbane QLD 4000
GPO Box 2454, Brisbane QLD 4001

Terms of Reference: Expert Review of the submitted Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP)

Task:

To undertake an independent external scientific review of the Black-throated Finch Management Plan as submitted by Adani to the Environmental Services and Regulation (ESR) division of the Queensland Department of Environment and Science.

Questions:

1. Does the Black-throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP) as submitted identify and address all the impacts with respect to the proposed loss and disturbance of Black-throated Finch habitat, the impact on Black-throated finch populations.
2. Are the proposed management and mitigation measures as detailed in the BTFMP commensurate with the impacts?
3. Within the scope of the Environmental Authority conditions (I6, I8 and I9), are there any significant omissions that should be addressed in the BTFMP?
4. Does the BTFMP as submitted provide management and mitigation measures that are based on the best available science and conservation knowledge?
5. If the management and mitigation measures are not based on the best available science and conservation knowledge, from an expert's perspective what inclusions are necessary to ensure that the BTFMP is consistent with the best available science and conservation knowledge?
6. Overall, from a scientific expert's perspective does the BTFMP as submitted provide an acceptable approach to plan, manage and mitigate the impacts of the proposed Carmichael Coal Mine on the Black-throated Finch populations and habitat within the project area?
7. Please provide any additional comments on the BTFMP as submitted, which would ensure that the BTFMP better meets its objectives as stated in the Environmental Authority conditions.

Deliverables:

- A written review agreed by the Expert Panel of the Black Throated Finch Management Plan as submitted.
- Written recommendations to the department regarding a science-based response to the Black Throated Finch Management Plan.

Process and terms:

As both a Professor in Conservation Ecology, and the National Director of the National Environment Science Program's Threatened Species Recovery Hub, Professor Brendan Wintle is recognised as most suitably qualified expert to be asked to form a panel of up to six leading scientist experts, highly experienced and qualified in relevant fields, to perform a review of the submitted BTFMP.

This will be conducted as a contracted research project. It is proposed that this review be completed within 8 (eight) weeks from commencement. A budget of up to \$20,000 will be provided by the department for the review. Other terms and conditions, including confidentiality and Intellectual Property, will be finalised via a Grant Deed to be provided.

Upon acceptance of this approach, the Expert Panel would be provided with the Black Throated Finch Management Plan as submitted, and a copy of the relevant Environmental Authority.



Department of
Environment and Science

Our Ref: CTS 35829/18

07 DEC 2018

Professor Brendan Wintle
Professor in Conservation Ecology
Biosciences School
The University of Melbourne
PARKVILLE CAMPUS VIC 3010
b.wintle@unimelb.edu.au

Dear Professor Wintle

I write regarding a request for you and relevant colleagues to undertake an Expert Review of the submitted Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP), received from Adani in relation to its proposed Carmichael coal mine in Queensland.

The Environmental Services & Regulation (ESR) division of the Queensland Department of Environment and Science has been assessing this BTFMP, in parallel with the Commonwealth Department of Environment. This is a required component of the overall suite of approvals Adani requires for the proposed mine.

The ESR division of the department wishes to ensure that a final decision regarding the potential approval of the BTFMP is consistent with the very best threatened species and conservation science, and is assessed and reviewed externally to government by highly qualified experts in relevant fields. This will help ensure the final decision is both guided by independent scientific analysis and beyond reproach in terms of its objectivity.

I understand that as both a Professor in Conservation Ecology, and the National Director of the National Environment Science Program's Threatened Species Recovery Hub, you are the recognised and most suitably qualified expert to approach in this regard.

I therefore invite you as a leading scientist to form a panel of up to six experts, highly experienced and qualified in relevant fields, to perform an external review of the BTFMP. This work would be performed as a panel of contracted scientists and science leaders, rather than under the auspices of the NESP Threatened Species Recovery Hub.

The attached draft Terms of Reference would guide the work of the Expert Panel, and lays out the proposed conduct of the review in terms of time, costs and report.

I look forward to hearing back from you at your earliest convenience regarding your preparedness to undertake this work, and your acceptance of this offer.

GPO Box 2454 Brisbane
Queensland 4001 Australia
Telephone 3330 5550
Website www.des.qld.gov.au
ABN 46 640 294 485

Should you require any further information, you may contact Ms Melissa Wells, Executive Director, Coal and Central Queensland Compliance of the Department of Environment and Science on telephone (07) 4987 9343 or by email at melissa.wells@des.qld.gov.au.

Yours sincerely

sch4p4(6) Personal information

Dean Ellwood
**Deputy Director-General
Environmental Services and Regulation**

Encl.

Date : 10/12/2018 10:35:42 AM
From : "MCCOSKER Juliana"
To : "WELLS Melissa"
Subject : RE: Expert Review - Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP)
Hi Melissa,

Brendan's number is sch4p4(6) Pdf

Ciao for now

Juliana

From: WELLS Melissa
Sent: Monday, 10 December 2018 9:55 AM
To: MCCOSKER Juliana
Subject: Re: Expert Review - Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP)

Hi can you chase the contact details for Prof Wintle please?

Sent from my iPhone

On 10 Dec 2018, at 8:19 am, MCCOSKER Juliana <Juliana.Mccosker@des.qld.gov.au> wrote:

FYI

From: WELLS Melissa
Sent: Friday, 7 December 2018 2:29 PM
To: MCCOSKER Juliana; BENNINK Kate
Subject: FW: Expert Review - Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP)

<image002.png> **Melissa Wells**
Executive Director
Coal and Central Qld Compliance
Department of Environment and Science

P 07 4987 9343

99 Hospital Road, Emerald QLD 4720
PO Box 3028, Emerald QLD 4720

From: Corro DES ESR DDG
Sent: Friday, 7 December 2018 2:24 PM
To: b.wintle@unimelb.edu.au
Cc: WELLS Melissa <Melissa.Wells@des.qld.gov.au>
Subject: Expert Review - Black Throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP)

Dear Professor Wintle

Please find attached letter from Dean Ellwood DDG ESR in relation to undertaking an Expert review of the BTFMP. Please note the original will not be posted.

Kind regards
Tonina

<image005.png>
Office of the Deputy Director-General
Environmental Services and Regulation
Department of Environment and Science

P 07 3330 5549
Level 7, 400 George St, Brisbane QLD 4000
GPO Box 2454, Brisbane QLD 4001

<Terms of Reference for BTFMP Expert Review.pdf>
<DDG Letter to Prof B Wintle - 07-12-18.pdf>

Date : 14/12/2018 10:13:08 AM
From : "BENNINK Kate"
To : "CAGNEY Justin"
Cc : "MCCOSKER Juliana"
Subject : RE: re. BTFMP letter
Attachment : DRAFT BTFMP letter 14 December 2018.docx;image003.png;image004.png;image001.png;
Justin, for your review. Thanks, Kate



Kate Bennink
Director
Business Centre (Coal) | Coal and Central Queensland Compliance
Environmental Services and Regulation
Department of Environment and Science

P (07) 4987 9338 | M Sch4p4(6) F
E kate.bennink@des.qld.gov.au
99 Hospital Road, Emerald QLD 4720
PO Box 3028, Emerald QLD 4720

From: MCCOSKER Juliana
Sent: Friday, 14 December 2018 9:58 AM
To: BENNINK Kate
Subject: re. BTFMP letter

Hi Kate,

Please see attached.

Ciao for now

Juliana



Juliana McCosker
Manager
Coal and Central Queensland Compliance
Department of Environment and Science

P 07 4987 9356 M Sch4p4(6) F
99 Hospital Road, Emerald QLD 4720
PO Box 3028, Emerald QLD 4720



Department of
Environment and Science

Our Ref: Black-throated Finch Management Plan

15 December 2018

Hamish Manzi
Head of Environment and Sustainability
Adani Mining Pty Ltd
Level 25, 10 Eagle Street
Brisbane QLD 4000

Dear Mr Manzi

Thank you for the Black-throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP) submitted to the Department of Environment and Science (the department) on 2 November 2018.

Please be advised that the department has requested the National Director of the National Environmental Science Program's Threatened Species Recovery Hub to lead an independent scientific panel review of the BTFMP.

The independent scientific panel review of the BTFMP will ensure that the department's decision on the BTFMP is consistent with the very best threatened species and conservation science, and that the final decision on the BTFMP is beyond reproach in terms of its objectivity.

It is expected that the review will be completed within 8 weeks, and the department's decision on the approval of the BTFMP will be made after the department's receives the advice from the independent scientific panel review.

Furthermore, the department reminds Adani that project stage 2 activities at the Carmichael Coal Mine cannot commence prior to approval of the BTFMP and the Groundwater Dependent Ecosystem Management Plan.

Should you require any further information, please contact **me** on telephone (07) 4987 9356 or by email at juliana.mccosker@des.qld.gov.au.

Yours sincerely

Juliana McCosker
Director
Business Centre Coal
Coal and Central Queensland Compliance
Environmental Services and Regulation

Business Centre Coal
PO Box 3028, Emerald
Queensland 4720 Australia
Telephone +61 7 4987 9320
Website www.des.qld.gov.au
ABN 46 640 294 485

Date : 20/12/2018 12:14:30 PM

From : "MCCOSKER Juliana"

To : "Brendan Wintle" , "john.woinarski@cdu.edu.au" , "stephen.garnett@cdu.edu.au" , "david.lindenmayer@anu.edu.au" , "sarah.legge@anu.edu.au"

Subject : re. additional documents as requested

Attachment : Rev3 Carmichael BOS_CONFIDENTIAL no App C

reduced.pdf;MDW_OAMP_CCMR_REV2_31Oct2018.pdf;BTF_BMP_outline.pdf;

Hi Everyone,

Please see attached. I will try and track down the Species management program (not plan anymore under NCA) for you.

Ciao for now

Juliana

Published on DES Disclosure Log
RTI Act 2009

Date : 14/12/2018 9:57:48 AM
From : "MCCOSKER Juliana"
To : "BENNINK Kate"
Subject : re. BTFMP letter
Attachment : BTFMP letter 14 December 2018.docx;image001.png;image002.png;
Hi Kate,

Please see attached.

Ciao for now

Juliana



Juliana McCosker
Manager
Coal and Central Queensland Compliance
Department of Environment and Science

P 07 4987 9356 M sch4p4(6)
99 Hospital Road, Emerald QLD 4720
PO Box 3028, Emerald QLD 4720



Department of
Environment and Science

Our Ref: Black-throated Finch Management Plan

14 December 2018

Hamish Manzi
Head of Environment and Sustainability
Adani Mining Pty Ltd
Level 25, 10 Eagle Street
Brisbane QLD 4000

Dear Mr Manzi

Thank you for the Black-throated Finch Management Plan (BTFMP) submitted to the department on 2 November 2018.

The department has requested the National Director of the National Environmental Science Program's Threatened Species Recovery to Hub to lead an independent scientific panel review of the BTFMP.

The independent scientific panel review of the BTFMP will ensure that the department's decision on the BTFMP is consistent with the very best threatened species and conservation science, and the decision is beyond reproach in terms of its objectivity.

The department decision on the approval of the BTFMP will be made after this scientific panel review is completed.

Furthermore, the department reminds Adani that without the approval of the GDEMP and BTFMP, stage 2 mining activities at the Carmichael Coal Mine are not authorised to commence under its environmental authority.

Should you require any further information, please contact Juliana McCosker, Manager, Business Centre Coal on telephone (07) 4987 9356 or by email at juliana.mccosker@des.qld.gov.au.

Yours sincerely

Kate Bennink
Director
Business Centre Coal
Coal and Central Queensland Compliance
Environmental Services and Regulation

Business Centre Coal
PO Box 3028, Emerald
Queensland 4720 Australia
Telephone +61 7 4987 9320
Website www.des.qld.gov.au
ABN 46 640 294 485

Date : 17/12/2018 5:04:16 PM
From : "MCCOSKER Juliana"
To : "'b.windle@unimelb.edu.au'"
Cc : "CAGNEY Justin" , "WELLS Melissa"
Subject : RE. BTFMP review
Attachment : BTF Management Plan_v7B 20181217 final.pdf;image001.png;image003.png;
Hi Brendan,

Thank you for agreeing to undertake the review of the BTFMP. Please see attached BTFMP and links to the environmental authority and the CG evaluation report.

<https://apps.des.qld.gov.au/env-authorities/pdf/epml01470513.pdf>

<http://statedevelopment.qld.gov.au/resources/project/carmichael/carmichael-coal-mine-and-rail-cg-report-may2014.pdf>

In order to progress the work contract could you please provide me with the following:

1. The University of Melbourne's – ABN number
2. Copies of workers compensation insurance, public liability insurance and professional indemnity insurance
3. Your contact number and postal address
4. Bank Account details.

Please do not hesitate to contact me, if you need any further information.

Ciao for now

Juliana



Juliana McCosker
Manager
Coal and Central Queensland Compliance
Department of Environment and Science
P 07 4987 9356 M sch4p4(6)
99 Hospital Road, Emerald QLD 4720
PO Box 3028, Emerald QLD 4720